

WOMEN'S LEADERSHIP FROM HADITH PERSPECTIVE

KEPEMIMPINAN PEREMPUAN PERSPEKTIF HADITS

Kartini ¹

¹ Universitas Islam As'adiyah Sengkang

Dr. Muh. Sabir Maidin, M.Ag ²

² UIN Alauddin Makassar

Prof. Dr. H. Arifuddin Ahmad, M.Ag ³

³ UIN Alauddin Makassar

* kartiniskg46@gmail.com

Article Info:

Received Juli 4, 2024

Revised Agustus 12, 2024

Accepted September 2, 2024

Available online Oktober 25, 2024

ABSTRACT

One of the traditions that require a comprehensive understanding is the hadith related to the leadership of a woman, because the Sunnah is the second source in establishing Islamic law, so this related problem really needs attention with the tahlili method. One of the reasons is because al-hadith are not all qath'i al-wurud (valid from the Prophet), so it requires takhrij al-Hadis (proof of validity) and in-depth understanding by using various approaches, both textually, intertextually and contextually.

Keywords: Hadith, Leader, Women

ABSTRAK (BAHASA INDONESIA)

Salah satu hadis yang membutuhkan pemahaman secara komprehensif adalah hadis yang terkait dengan kepemimpinan seorang wanita, karena al-sunnah merupakan sumber kedua dalam menetapkan syariat hukum Islam maka masalah yang terkait ini sangat perlu mendapat perhatian dengan metode tahlili. Salah satu alasannya karena al-hadis tidak semuanya qath'i al-wurud (valid dari Rasulullah), maka dibutuhkan takhrij al-Hadis (pembuktian kevalidan) dan pemahaman yang mendalam dengan menggunakan berbagai pendekatan, baik secara tekstual, interteks maupun kontekstual.

Kata-kata kunci: Hadits, Pemimpin, Wanita

A. INTRODUCTION

Human life has become so complex. The development of science and technology triggers humans to always develop themselves. The potential that exists in a person becomes a big capital

in the formation of productive human resources. Not only all of this is done by men but also women begin to take part in achieving their goals, especially in the public environment. Now, the ambition to become the leader has also begun to be intensively carried out by some women. However, normative texts provide some interpretations about whether or not a woman can take part in public affairs. Several passages from the Qur'an and hadith express the position of women and state that Islam highly upholds the dignity of women. There is no discrimination between men and women in their human value as fellow human beings and as servants of Allah SWT. (Rachmat Ramadhana al-Banjari, 2008).

After the determination of the status of the hadith, it does not mean that the problem of the hadith has been solved, but the deepening and study of the meaning and content of the hadith is no less important, because the matan of the hadith is sometimes narrated in meaning. As for the hadith studied in this paper, the author limits it to Bukhari's narration only, the hadith in question is

حدثنا عثمان بن الهيثم حدثنا عوف عن الحسن عن أبي بكر قال: لقد نفعني هلا بكلمة سمعتها من رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه وسلم أيام الجمل بعد ما كدت أن ألحق بأصحاب الجمل فأقاتل معهم قال لما بلغ رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه وسلم أن أهل فارس قد ملكوا عليهم بنت كسرى قال (لن يفلح قوم ولوا أمرهم امرأة)

This paper discusses a hadith narrated by Abu Bakrah regarding women's leadership found in the books of hadith to explore the content and divine message contained in the Prophet's hadith. in order to obtain a full and comprehensive understanding so that the values contained can provide insight and continue to make the Prophet's hadith a rahmatan li al-'alamin. (H.R Bukhari).

B. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

1. Hadiths on Women's Leadership

حدثنا عثمان بن الهيثم حدثنا عوف عن الحسن عن أبي بكره قال: لقد نفعني هلا بكلمة سمعتها من رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه وسلم أيام الجمل بعد ما كدت أن ألحق بأصحاب الجمل فأقاتل معهم قال لما بلغ رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه وسلم أن أهل فارس قد ملكوا عليهم بنت كسرى قال (لن يفلح قوم ولوا أمرهم امرأة)

Meaning

Us|man ibn al-His|am told us, 'Auf told us from Hasan from Abi Bakrah said: Allah has benefited me with the words that I heard from the Messenger of Allah at the battle of Jamal after I almost joined the battle of Jamal and fought with them. Abi Bakrah said: "When news reached the Messenger of Allah that the people of Persia had appointed Mrs. Kisra as queen, the Messenger of Allah said: There will be no success for a people. The Messenger of Allah said: "A people will not succeed if they are led by a woman." (H.R Bukhari).

Based on a search of the book al-Mu'jam al-Mufahras li Alfazh al-Hadis, by searching for one of the words in the text of the hadith, namely يفلح, the hadith was found in several books of hadith, especially al-kutub al-tis'ah.

Therefore, it can be seen that the hadith describing women's leadership in a global context is found in the following source books:

1. *Sahih al-Bukhari by al-Bukhari book al-Magazi chapter Kitab al-Nabi saw. ila Kisra with text:*

حدثنا عثمان بن الهيثم حدثنا عوف عن الحسن عن أبي بكره قال: لقد نفعني هلا بكلمة سمعتها من رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه وسلم أيام الجمل بعد ما كدت أن ألحق بأصحاب الجمل فأقاتل معهم قال لما بلغ رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه وسلم أن أهل فارس قد ملكوا عليهم بنت كسرى قال (لن يفلح قوم ولوا أمرهم امرأة)

And the book of *al-Fitan* chapter *al-Fitnah al-lati tamuju Kamauj al-Bahri* using text

حدثنا عثمان بن الهيثم حدثنا عوف عن الحسن عن أبي بكره قال: لقد نفعني هلا بكلمة أيام الجمل لما بلغ النبي صلى هلا عليه و سلم أن فارسا ملكوا ابنة كسرى قال (لن يفلح قوم ولوا أمرهم امرأة).

2. *Sunan al-Nasai*, book of *Adab al-Qud}ah* chapter *al-Nahy 'an Isti'mal al-Nisa'fi al-Hukm* using the phrase:

أخبرنا محمد بن المثنى قال حدثنا خالد بن الحرث قال حدثنا حميد عن الحسن عن أبي بكره قال: عصمني هلا بشيء سمعته من رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه وسلم لما هلك كسرى قال من استخلفوا قالوا بنته قال لن يفلح قوم ولوا أمرهم امرأة.

3. *Sunan al-Turmuzi* by *Imam al-Turmuzi* book *al-Fitan* chapter 75. by using text:

حدثنا محمد بن المثنى حدثنا خالد بن الحرث حدثنا حميد الطويل عن الحسن عن أبي بكره قال : عصمني هلا بشيء سمعته من رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه و سلم لما هلك كسرى قال من استخلفوا ؟ قالوا ابنته فقال النبي صلى هلا عليه و سلم لن يفلح قوم ولو أمرهم امرأة قال فلما قدمت عائشة تعني البصرة ذكرت قول رسول هلا صلى هلا عليه و سلم فعصمني هلا به.

4. *Musnad Ahmad*, *Musnad Abi Bakrah*, using text:

Asbab al-Wurud of the Hadith

Before understanding the meaning of the above Hadith, it is necessary to know its asbab al-wurud. This is very necessary so that the understanding of the text of the hadith is not understood textually only. This Hadīth was delivered by the Prophet when he heard news from one of his companions about the appointment of a queen in Persia named Buwaran bint Syairawaih ibn Kisra. She was appointed queen because her brothers were killed in a power struggle while the royal family did not want power to be separated from the descendants of previous kings. The incident occurred in the year 9 AH.

The reason for Abu Bakrah's narration of this hadith is the incident of al-jamal where 'Aisha, Talhah and al-Zubayr agreed to go to Bashrah to invite the people to demand the death of 'Uthman ibn 'Affan to the ruling government, namely the caliph 'Ali ibn Abi Talib to carry out the qishash law against the killers of 'Uthman. Then Abu Bakrah did not want to join 'A'ishah even though Abu Bakrah agreed with 'A'ishah in the battle of al-Jamal on the grounds of the above hadith so Abu Bakrah decided not to intervene in the battle of al-Jamal.

ملكوا: the root word is ملك (م-ل-ك) which means strength in something and its truth, so the word ملكوا in the sentence above means "they have strengthened the country of Persia by appointing Bintu Kisra as the leader".

يفلح: Its origin is the letter ف-ل-ح which has two meanings, which means شق (shaq) and means فوز وبقاء (victory and permanence).

امرأة: is a derivation of the word م-ر-أ and a ta'nis| form of the word امرئ (someone).

لقد نفعني هلا The sentence is Abu Bakrah's interpretation of the events that occurred in the battle of al-jamal by not joining 'Aisha's group, even though he agreed with her, so Abu Bakrah felt that Allah had given him guidance and benefit from the existence of the Prophet's hadith.

قد ملكوا عليهم بنت كسرى this sentence means that the people of Persia have appointed Bintu Kisra as the leader (queen). after their male descendants of the previous king died in a power struggle, so inevitably he had to be his father's successor because it is customary for a person to be replaced by his son.

2. Understanding the Hadith on Women's Leadership from the Thematic Hadith Perspective

If observed textually, the above hadith states that a country will not reap success and success if the one who leads them is a woman. Such an understanding will have implications for the massive degradation of the quality of women, so that they have no right at all to govern the country.

The majority of scholars understand the hadith on women's leadership textually. They argue that based on the instructions of the hadith the appointment of women as heads of state, judges of courts and other political offices is prohibited. Furthermore, they state that women according to Shara' are only given the responsibility of looking after their husband's property. Hence, al-Khattabi for example says that it is not valid for a woman to be the caliph. Similarly, al-Syaukani, in interpreting the hadith, argues that women are not experts in leadership and therefore cannot be the head of state. Meanwhile, other scholars such as Ibn Hazm, al-Ghazali although with different reasons also require a man as head of state.

In addition, there are also scholars who state that women are not fit to be leaders because they lack and weak intellect while leadership requires a great ability to go out to take care of the people and women are aurat so they are not fit to be leaders or judges. In addition, the elements of leadership at the time of the Prophet were as a leader of the State, prayer leader and warlord. While women cannot fulfill the three elements of leadership.

The existence of the prohibition of women becoming leaders is signaled by the interpretation of some scholars based on the Qur'anic text that men are leaders of women, as in the Qur'an.

الرِّجَالُ قَوَّامُونَ عَلَى النِّسَاءِ بِمَا فَضَّلَ اللَّهُ بَعْضَهُمْ عَلَى بَعْضٍ وَبِمَا أَنْفَقُوا مِنْ أَمْوَالِهِمْ فَالصَّالِحَاتُ قَانِتَاتٌ حَافِظَاتٌ لِّلْغَيْبِ بِمَا حَفِظَ اللَّهُ وَالَّتِي تَخَافُونَ نُشُوزَهُنَّ فَعِظُوهُنَّ وَأَهْجُرُوهُنَّ فِي الْمَضَاجِعِ وَاصْرَبُوهُنَّ فَإِنْ أَطَعْنَكُمْ فَلَا تَبْغُوا عَلَيْهِنَّ سَبِيلًا إِنَّ اللَّهَ كَانَ عَلِيمًا كَبِيرًا

Translation:

"The men are the rulers of the women, because Allah has preferred some of them (men) over others (women), and because they (men) have spent some of their wealth. Therefore, the virtuous women are those who obey Allah and keep

themselves in the absence of their husbands, because Allah has taken care of them. Those women whom you fear may be unfaithful, admonish them, separate them from their beds, and beat them. Then if they obey you, then do not seek to trouble them. Indeed, Allah is Most High, Most Great". (QS. Al Nisa: 34).

Some contemporary scholars take a different view of this verse. The reasons they put forward include first, that this verse talks about domestic areas, so it cannot be the basis for leadership in public areas. Second, that this verse is not normative but informative about the situation and conditions of Arab society (the world) at that time, so it has no legal consequences. Third, because there are a number of other verses that indicate the permissibility of women's leadership such as in Surah al-Taubah verse 71, which gives women the right to territory over men. The word wilayah can mean control, leadership, cooperation and mutual help. Fourth, rijal in this verse does not mean male gender, but masculinity traits that can be possessed by both men and women.

Contemporary scholars try to understand this hadith in context, this is because if viewed directly there is an understanding that seems contradictory so that it requires synchronization of understanding. Previously, it is necessary to know the historical background of the emergence of this hadith which when the prophet delivered this hadith he had previously received information that a woman (Bintu Kisra) had been appointed as leader by the Persian state in place of her father. Whereas at that time the existence of women as leaders was still denied, those who had the right to become leaders were men. Of course this violated the traditions that existed at that time. In addition, the abilities of women are not the same as men, Arab women at that time only took care of family matters and were not trusted to handle public or state affairs and did not have scientific capacity in the public domain. In the conditions of the Persian empire and the social setting like that, it is natural that the Prophet SAW, who has high wisdom, throws the hadith that the nation that leaves state and community problems to women will not be successful.

In addition, they also argue that when the Prophet delivered the hadith he was not in his capacity as a prophet or apostle, but it needs to be understood that he delivered it in his capacity as an

ordinary human being or as a person who informed the social reality at that time and to anticipate the possibilities that occurred if the leadership was left to women. There are also contemporary scholars who argue for the permissibility of women becoming leaders. However, she can lead if she has the same abilities and expertise as those possessed by men. Syuhudi Ismail argues that when women have the authority and ability to lead, and the community is willing to accept them as leaders, then there is nothing wrong with women being chosen and appointed as leaders.³² Another opinion also states that women are legitimate to be the head of the State if he is not the highest power. That is, there are still institutions above the head of State or president.

With some of the arguments/statements put forward by contemporary scholars above, it can be understood that the hadith about the prohibition of women becoming leaders is not related to the discourse on the shar'i requirements for a leader. He was only responding to the appointment of the Queen of Persia. However, there are several possibilities if this is attributed to the personal opinion of the Prophet, namely that it may be that the Prophet's words are a prayer that the leader of the Persian country will not be successful and it may be that this is the Prophet's personal opinion based on the reality of the traditions of the community which at that time did not allow a woman to lead the country because she would not be legitimized and not respected by the community if she was trusted to be their leader.

Therefore, this means that the above Hadith must be understood contextually as it is temporal and not universal. The Hadith only reveals the real facts about the social conditions at the time of the Hadith and applies to the case of the Persian state only and is not intended as a Shari'ah requirement that the leader must be male. Thus, women can be leaders as long as they are not at the level of leaders who have absolute authority that requires male requirements such as being a prayer leader.

From some of the statements of the jumhur scholars and contemporary scholars above, the position of the author in this paper is more likely to argue the same as stated by contemporary scholars that the above hadith must be understood contextually. Women are fine to be leaders as long as they have the capability to carry out leadership duties. However, what needs to be remem-

bered is that women must remember their limits and still maintain the benefit.

C. CONCLUSION

The hadith was narrated by Imam Bukhari, Nasai, Turmudzi and Ahmad, although the text has different wording. In one of the narrations Imam Ahmad uses the phrase *تملكهم امرأة* *ال يفلح قوم*. Since this hadith only focuses on Imam Bukhari's narration, its status is *sahih* considering that Bukhari has credibility in terms of hadith narration and is the most authentic book after the Qur'an.

According to the contextual understanding, this Hadith allows women to hold a leadership position as long as they are capable and credible. This Hadith is temporal and is not to be understood textually, let alone looking at the socio-historical setting.

The messages and clues that can be gleaned from the above hadith include that in some cases women have limitations, the importance of understanding the capacity of the prophet at the time of conveying the hadith, socio-historical and political conditions greatly affect the understanding of a hadith text.

D. REFERENCES

- Abd al-Rauf al-Manawi, Faidh al-Qadir , Juz V (Cet. I; Bairut: Dar al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyah, 8387 H./8993 M), h. 426.
- Abu 'Abd al-Rahman Ahmad ibn Syu'aib al-Nasai, Sunan al-Nasai, Juz. VI (Cet. V; Bairut: Dar al-Ma'rifah, 8380 H.), h. 754.
- Abu 'Abdillah Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Hambal, Musnad Ahmad ibn Hambal, Juz. IV (Cet. I; Bairut: 'Alam al-Kutub, 1419 H./1998 M.), h. 38
- Abu 'Abdillah Muhammad ibn Isma'il al-Bukhari, Shahih al-Bukhari, Juz. IV (Cet. III; Bairut: Dar Ibn Katsir, 1407 H./1987 M.), h. 1610. Lihat pula; RAHIM, Abdul. Peran Kepemimpinan Perempuan Dalam Perspektif Gender. AL-MAIYYAH, 2016, 9.2: 268-295.

Abu al-Hajjaj Yusuf ibn al-Zaki al-Mizzi, Tahzib al-Kamal, Juz XXX (Cet. I; Beirut: Muassasah al-Risalah, 1400 H./1980 M.), h. 5.

al-Tahzib, Juz. X (Cet. I; Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1404 H./1984 M.), h. 418., Juz. V, h. 57. Dan Juz. VII, h. 143. Abu al-Hajjaj Yusuf ibn al-Zaki al-Mizzi, op.cit., Juz. XXX, h. 5., Juz.VI h. 5`17. dan Juz. XIX, h. 502.

Ambo Asse, Hadis Ahkam: Ibadah, Sosial dan Politik (Cet. I; Makassar: Alauddin University Press, 2009), h. 204.

Arifuddin Ahmad, Paradigma Baru Memahami Hadis Nabi (Cet. I; Jakarta: Renaisan, 2005), h. 1-2.

Dikutip dari situs internet <http://www.acehinstitute.org>. Yazid, Meyzarti.Wacana Pemimpin Perempuan Dalam Islam. AL-MAIYYAH, 2017, 10.1: 1-24.

Disebut perang al-jamal karena 'Aisyah menunggang unta dalam menghadapi 'Ali ibn Abi T{alib pada saat itu.

Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani, Fath al-Bari Syarah al-Bukhari, Juz. XIII (Dar al-Ma'rifah: Beirut, 1379 H), h. 56.

Koreksi Syekh al-Albani terhadap kitab: Muhammad ibn 'Abdullah al-Khat{ib al-Tibrizi, Misykah al-Mashabih, Juz. II (Cet. III; Beirut: al-Maktab al-Islami, 1405 H./1985 M.), h. 340.

Muhammad ibn 'Ali ibn Muhammad al-Syaukani, Nail al-Aut{ar, Jux VII (Mesir: Mustafa al-Babi al-Halabi, t.t.) , h. 298. Lihat pula; FATMAWATI, Fatmawati. Kepemimpinan Perempuan Perspektif Hadis. AL-MAIYYAH, 2015, 8.2: 262-284.

Muhammad Abd al-Rahman al-Mubarakfuri, Tuhfah al-Ah{wazi, Juz. VI, (Dar al- Kutub al-Ilmiyyah: Beirut, t. th), h. 447.

Muhammad ibn 'Isa al-Turmuzi, Sunan al-Turmuzi, Juz. IV (Beirut: Dar Ihya' al- Turats al-'Arabi, t.th.), h. 785.

Nizar Ali, Hadis Versus Sains: Memahami Hadis-Hadis Musykil (Cet. I; Yogyakarta: Penerbit Teras, 2008), h. 117.

Rachmat Ramadhana al-Banjari, Prophetic Leadership (Cet. I; Yogyakarta: Diva Press, 2008), h. 85.

Syuhudi Ismail, Hadis Nabi Yang Tekstual dan Kontekstual (Cet.I; Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1994), h. 67.